

A regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission convened at 8:30 A.M.

PRESENT: COMMISSIONERS: Julie Bartolotto
E. Thor Carlson
Doris Felix
Karen Highberger
John Malveaux
Ana Maria McGuan
Brian Ulaszewski
William Wynne
Kevin Motschall, Vice Chair
Layne Johnson, Chair

EX OFFICIO: Stanley E. Poe

ABSENT: " : Laura Brasser
Mike Burrous
Kevin Doherty (Excused)
Dan Pressburg
Kerrie Weaver

ALSO PRESENT: Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer
Shaine Klima, Historic Preservation Aide
Nancy Muth, City Clerk Specialist

Chair Johnson presiding.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

There being no objection, Chair Johnson declared that the minutes of the meeting held April 19, 2006, be approved as submitted.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

John J. Chvostal, 315 W. Third Street, spoke regarding elastomeric paint removal at the historic Willmore building.

Commissioners Brasser and Weaver entered.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Nomination of 302 Orizaba Avenue as City Landmark

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Malveaux, that the Espey/Lockridge House at 302 Orizaba be nominated for historic landmark designation under the Commission's criteria A, C, D, E, and I (Section 2.63.050 of the Cultural Heritage Commission ordinance). Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Brasser,Carlson Felix,Highberger,Malveaux, McGuan,Ulaszewski,Weaver, Wynne,Motschall.
NOES:	"	: None.
ABSENT:	"	: Burrous,Doherty,Pressburg.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

Nomination of 12 Virgil Walk as City Landmark

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Burrous entered.

Commissioner Malveaux moved, seconded by Commissioner McGuan, that the Giebisch/Olson House at 12 Virgil Walk not be recommended for nomination as an historic landmark due to a lack of supporting criteria. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Brasser,Felix, Highberger,Malveaux,McGuan, Ulaszewski,Weaver,Wynne.
NOES:	"	: Burrous,Carlson,Motschall.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty,Pressburg.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

NEW BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Addition, 3943 East Fifth Street

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Commissioner Pressburg entered.

A discussion ensued.

John Johnson, owner, 3943 East Fifth Street, and Roger Peter Porter, Roger Peter Porter Architect, Inc. 3837 East 7th Street, spoke regarding the proposed project; and responded to questions.

Commissioner Motschall moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition at 3943 East Fifth Street be approved as submitted, with the exceptions that the tree retention be clarified in the written plans, and that the applicant work with staff regarding the sliding door design detail.

A discussion ensued.

As a substitute motion, Commissioner Malveaux moved that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition at 3943 East Fifth Street be approved based on the conditions recommended by staff.

The substitute motion died for lack of a second.

Commissioner Burrous moved, seconded by Commissioner Ulaszewski, to end discussion on the motion. The motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Burrous,Highberger, Pressburg,Weaver.
NOES:	"	: Bartolotto,Brasser,Carlson, Felix,Malveaux,McGuan, Ulaszewski,Wynne,Motschall.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

As a substitute motion, Commissioner Malveaux moved, seconded by Commissioner Wynne, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition at 3943 East Fifth Street be approved based on the conditions recommended by staff.

A discussion ensued.

The motion failed by the following vote;

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Brasser,Highberger, Malveaux,McGuan,Wynne.
NOES:	"	: Bartolotto,Burrous,Carlson, Felix,Pressburg,Ulaszewski, Weaver,Motschall.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

May 17, 2006

As a substitute motion, Commissioner Ulaszewski moved, seconded by Commissioner Bartolotto, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition at 3943 East Fifth Street be approved in concept, with the exceptions that the garage gable become a secondary feature, the tree retention be clarified in the written plans, and that the applicant work with staff regarding the sliding door design detail. The motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Brasser,Burrous, McGuan,Pressburg,Ulaszewski.
NOES:	"	: Carlson,Felix,Highberger, Malveaux,Weaver, Wynne,Motschall.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

The main motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Burrous, Pressburg,Motschall.
NOES:	"	: Brasser,Carlson,Felix, Highberger,Malveaux,McGuan, Ulaszewski,Weaver,Wynne.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

Commissioner Motschall moved, seconded by Commissioner Malveaux, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition at 3943 East Fifth Street be approved as submitted, with the exceptions that the tree retention be clarified in the written plans, the garage gable become a secondary feature, the 66 square foot in-fill omitted with possible egress design, and the applicant work with staff regarding the sliding door design detail. The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto,Brasser,Burrous,Carlson Felix,Highberger,Malveaux, McGuan,Pressburg,Ulaszewski, Weaver,Wynne,Motschall.
NOES:	"	: None.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

At 9:58 A.M., Chair Johnson declared a recess.

The meeting reconvened at 10:08 A.M.

May 17, 2006

PRESENT: COMMISSIONERS: Julie Bartolotto
Laura Brasser
Mike Burrous
E. Thor Carlson
Doris Felix
Karen Highberger
John Malveaux
Ana Maria McGuan
Dan Pressburg
Brian Ulaszewski
Kerrie Weaver
William Wynne
Kevin Motschall, Vice Chair
Layne Johnson, Chair

EX OFFICIO: Stanley E. Poe

ABSENT: " : Kevin Doherty (Excused)

ALSO PRESENT: Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer
Shaine Klima, Historic Preservation Aide
Nancy Muth, City Clerk Specialist

Chair Johnson presiding.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Removal and New Construction, 732 Molino Avenue

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Roger Peter Porter, Roger Peter Porter Architect, Inc., 3837 East 7th Street, spoke regarding the proposed project; expressed a willingness to work with staff regarding revisions; and responded to questions.

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Burrous, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for removal and new construction at 732 Molino Avenue be approved based on staff recommendations and Secretary of the Interior Standards Nos. 2, 9 and 10, and return to staff for review. Carried by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Bartolotto, Brasser, Burrous, Highberger, Malveaux, McGuan, Pressburg, Ulaszewski, Weaver, Wynne, Motschall.
NOES:	"	: Carlson, Felix.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

**Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and New Construction,
3039-3049 East Ocean Boulevard**

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Joel and Annette Fruehan, P. O. Box 3411, Seal Beach, discussed the proposed project; and responded to questions.

Bill Pratt, 3040 East First Street, expressed his opinion regarding the proposed project and the impact to the surround neighborhood.

Bob Fitts, no address given, spoke regarding the proposed project.

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Malveaux, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and new construction at 3039-3049 East Ocean Boulevard be approved, based on Secretary of Interior Standards Nos. 2, 5 and 8.

A discussion ensued regarding the property's non-contributing status, the eucalyptus trees at the property, and the surrounding structures.

As a substitute motion, Commissioner Motschall moved, seconded by Commissioner Malveaux, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for only demolition at 3039-3049 East Ocean Boulevard be approved.

A discussion ensued.

The substitute motion failed by the following vote:

AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:	Malveaux, Wynne.
NOES:	"	: Bartolotto, Brasser, Burrous, Carlson, Felix, Highberger, McGuan, Pressburg, Ulaszewski, Weaver, Motschall.
ABSENT:	"	: Doherty.
ABSTAINED:	"	: Johnson.

Commissioner Wynne, with the consent of the second, withdrew his main motion.

Following discussion, Annette Fruehan, P. O. Box 3411, Seal Beach, expressed a desire to work with staff regarding a redesign of the project.

Commissioner Pressburg moved, seconded by Commissioner Burrous, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and new construction at 3039-3049 East Ocean Boulevard be laid over to a future meeting and an ad hoc committee formed to work with the applicant. Carried by unanimous vote.

May 17, 2006

Commissioners Carlson, Pressburg and Wynne volunteered to act as the ad hoc committee for the 3039-3049 East Ocean Boulevard project.

Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction, Electric Court

Jan Ostashay, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the staff report, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Abdul Hoque, 20 East Market Street, spoke regarding the proposed project and responded to questions.

Commissioner Wynne moved, seconded by Commissioner Brasser, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction on Electric Court be denied, based on Secretary of Interior Standards Nos. 3, 9 and 10.

A discussion ensued.

Commissioner Wynne, with the consent of the second, withdrew his main motion.

Commissioner Carlson moved, seconded by Commissioner Pressburg, that the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction on Electric Court be laid over to a future meeting to allow applicant an opportunity to work with staff to revise the project. Carried by unanimous vote.

STAFF REPORT

Steve Scott, City Manager's Office, discussed the Fiscal Year 2007 Budget process; distributed budget information, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record; and responded to questions.

Greg Carpenter, Planning Bureau Manager, discussed the Planning Department budget; and responded to budget questions.

Staff distributed and discussed the By Laws revisions made by Mike Mais, Assistant City Attorney, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

Chair Johnson suggested that the By Laws be placed on the June agenda for discussion and adoption.

Chair Johnson retired from the Chair.

Commissioner Motschall assumed the Chair.

May 17, 2006

A discussion continued regarding budget issues.

Staff distributed the Certificate of Appropriateness monthly issuance update, a copy of which was received and made a part of the permanent record.

COMMISSIONER'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Bartolotto inquired regarding the method of decreasing the size of the Commission and determining the membership.

Commissioner Highberger commented that consideration must be given to the impact to neighborhoods in general when projects are reviewed.

Ex Officio Commissioner Poe thanked the staff for the detail included in the Certificate of Appropriateness monthly issuance update.

Commissioner Carlson expressed his views regarding the charge of the Commission to look to the future and retain a variety of good architecture.

Commissioner Wynne announced the upcoming Art Walk in Venice.

Commissioner McGuan reminded everyone to vote on Tuesday, June 6, 2006.

Commissioner Burrous shared an article and photograph of historic interest regarding Alamitos Bay.

ADJOURNMENT

At 12:19 P.M., there being no objection, Chair Pro Tempore Motschall declared the meeting adjourned.